

HUMAN DIGNITY FROM JUDGES' PERSPECTIVES

July 24-25, 2019 Pembroke College, Oxford (Harold Lee Seminar Room)

PROGRAM

Wednesday, July 24

Opening remarks. 9:00 - 9:15

- **1.** Prof. Brett G. Scharffs (Brigham Young University International Center for Law and Religion Studies)
 - 2. Dr. Dmytro Vovk (Yaroslav the Wise National Law University)

The time allocated for each presentation is 20 minutes with a further 10 minutes allowed for questions or discussion.

Session I. Human dignity in Common Law Jurisdictions and Mixed Legal Systems. 9:15 – 11:15

- 1. Prof. Paul Gowder (University of Iowa), Dignity and the Rule of Law against Self-Abnegation and Racial Inequality
- 2. Prof. Christine M. Venter (Notre Dame Law School), Acknowledging Persons and Communities of Infinite Worth: The Concept of Dignity in the Jurisprudence of the South African Constitutional Court
- 3. Prof. Taixia Shen (Jinan University of China), Judicial Interpretation of Human Dignity by the Hong-Kong's Courts
- 4. Prof. Eugene Kheng Boon Tan (School of Law at Singapore Management University), Not Quite Rights but Dignity and Respect: The Evolving Discourse on Protecting Foreign Domestic Workers in Singapore

Moderator – Prof. Brett G. Scharffs

Coffee Break

Session II. Human Dignity in Adjudication: Comparative Perspective. 11:30 – 12:30.

- 1. Prof. Ariel Bendor (Bar-Ilan University), Human Dignity as Chameleon
- 2. Prof. Giorgio Repetto (University of Perugia), Between Autonomy and Solidarity. The Non-subversive Judicial Use of Human Dignity in Social Rights Issues in Four European Countries

Moderator – Prof. Andrea Pin

Lunch at Christ Church Dining Hall

Session III. Dignity, Human Rights, and Religion. 14:00 – 16:00.

- 1. Prof. Brett G. Scharffs (Brigham Young University International Center for Law and Religion Studies), The Links Between Human Dignity and Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Belief in Adjudication
- 2. Prof. Zachary R. Calo (Hamad bin Khalifa University), **Human Dignity and Moral**Order in Constitutional Debate
- 3. Prof. Haim Shapira (Bar-Ilan University), Religious Perspective of Human Dignity in the Context of Israeli Case Law
- 4. Dr. Rodrigo Vitorino Souza Alves (Federal University of Uberlandia), Addressing Competing Rights Claims: The Role of Human Dignity in the Adjudication of Fundamental Rights in Brazil

Moderator – Dr. Dmytro Vovk

Coffee Break

Session IV. Human Dignity in International Jurisdictions. 16:30 – 18:00.

- 1. Prof. Andrea Pin (University of Padua), Supranational Dignity: The Court of Justice of European Union's Conceptualization of a Legal Value
- 2. Dr. Eugenia Relano Pastor (Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology), Human Dignity in the European Court of Human Rights
- 3. Dr. Adriana Dias Vieira (Fluminense Federal University), A Notion in Dispute: Human Dignity Discoursive Consonances and Dissonances in the European, Inter-American and Brazilian Case Law

Moderator – Prof. Christine M. Venter

Dinner at a Local Restaurant

Thursday, July 25

Session V. Human Dignity in Civil Law Jurisdictions. 9:30 – 11:00

- 1. Prof. Justin Collings (Brigham Young University), **Dignity Plus: Combining Dignity** with Other Values in German Constitutional Jurisprudence
- 2. Prof. Piotr Szymaniec (Angelus Silesius University of Applied Sciences in Wałbrzych), Human Dignity as Constitutional Value: The Viewpoint of Polish Courts
- 3. Dr. Olga Rosenkranzova (Palacký University in Olomouc), Human Dignity in Czech Justice and the Ombudsman

Moderator – Dr. Eugenia Relano Pastor

Session VII. Human Dignity in Post-Soviet Legal Systems. 11:30 – 12:30.

- 1. Prof. Mikhail Antonov (National Research University "Higher School of Economics"), Human (Personal) Dignity as an Argumentation Tool of the Russian Constitutional Court
- 2. Dr. Dmytro Vovk (Yaroslav the Wise National Law University), From Dignified Standard of Living to Human Dignity: Analysis of Jurisprudence of the Ukrainian Constitutional Court

Moderator – Prof. Piotr Szymaniec

Lunch at Christ Church Dining Hall

Session VIII. Human Dignity: Chinese Perspective in the Context of Punta Del Este Declaration on Human Dignity for Everyone Everywhere. 14:00 – 15:00.

- 1. Prof. Brett G. Scharffs (Brigham Young University International Center for Law and Religion Studies), Introductory Remarks on Punta Del Este Declaration on Human Dignity for Everyone Everywhere
- 2. Prof. Pinghua Sun (China University of Political Science and Law), China's Strategies towards Punta del Este Declaration on Human Dignity for Everyone Everywhere

Moderator – Dr. Dmytro Vovk

Concluding remarks, deadline for final drafts, and publication planning. 15:00 – 15:30.

Contributors to the volume, who are not able to participate in the workshop:

- 1. Prof. Neville G. Rochow (Adelaide University Law School) & Prof. Hans-Joachim Cremer (University of Mannheim), Dignity A Dialogue between the Anglophone Common Law World and the German Civil Code World
- 2. Prof. Dr. Miguel Á. Presno Linera (University of Oviedo), The Double Meaning of Human Dignity in the European Union: A Constitutional Principle and a Fundamental Right
- 3. Dr. Andrea Romeo ("Magna Græcia" University of Catanzaro), Jurisprudential Misadventures of Human Dignity: The Strange Case of the Italian Legal System

Participants

Mikhail Antonov is Professor of Law associated with the Law Faculty at the National Research University "Higher School of Economics" (Saint Petersburg) where he teaches legal theory and comparative law. He is practicing as a member of the Saint Petersburg Bar Association. Professor Antonov's research interests focus upon contemporary legal theory, history of legal concepts and ideas. He has published extensively, including recent books are *Theory of State and Law* (2018, in Russian) and *History of Russian Legal Thought* (2017, in Russian). Among his recent articles are: Legal Realism in Soviet and Russian Jurisprudence in *Review of Central and East European Law* (2018); Philosophy Behind Human Rights: Valery Zorkin vs. the West? in L. Mälksoo, W. Benedek (eds.), *Russia and European Court of Human Rights: The Strasbourg Effect* (Cambridge University Press, 2017), Law and Economics, Judicial Pragmatism and Their Limits on Both Sides of the Atlantic in *Review of Central and East European Law* (2017); Conservative Philosophy and Doctrine of Sovereignty: A Necessary Connection? in *Archiv für Rechts- und Sozialphilosophie* (2017).

Contact at: mich.antonov@gmail.com

Rodrigo Vitorino Souza Alves is a member of the Faculty of Law of Universidade Federal de Uberlândia, the Federal University of Uberlandia (Brazil) and the Leading Researcher of the Brazilian Center for Studies in Law and Religion. He is a researcher at the Ratio Legis — Center for Legal Research and Development of the Autonomous University of Lisbon on the topic religious freedom, social tension and security, and was an Academic Visitor at the University of Oxford in 2014-2015. At the United Nations Office at Geneva he served as guest speaker at the Sixth Session of the Forum on Minority Issues on Beyond Freedom of Religion or Belief: Guaranteeing the Rights of Religious Minorities (OHCHR), which led to the publication of a set of recommendations by the Human Rights Council. He sits at the International Academic Advisory Board of the Advanced Program on Religion and the Rule of Law and is a member of the Editorial Board of the Series Law and Religion in a Global Context, published by Springer, and the editor of the book Latin American Perspectives on Law and Religion. He was a member of the Expert Advisory Group for the International Development of Law Organization (IDLO) study on freedom of religion or belief.

Contact at: rodrigo@direitoereligiao.org

Ariel L. Bendor is Dean of the School of Graduate Studies and Frank F. Church Professor of Legal Research at Bar-Ilan University. He also serves as Head of the Center for Media and the Law and of the Law School Publishing House. Dean Bendor was a Visiting Scholar at the Yale Law School, a Distinguished Visiting Professor at the University of Maryland, and a Visiting Professor at the York University Osgoode Hall Law School and the University of Siena. Before joining Bar-Ilan in 2008 he was a faculty member at the University of Haifa, where he served as Dean of the Faculty of Law and Dean of Students. He was the Editor-in-Chief of the University of Haifa Press, the University of Haifa Law & Government Journal, and the Hebrew University Law Review. He also served as the Chairperson of the Israeli Association of Public Law. Dean Bendor's major fields of interest are constitutional and administrative Law. He is the author of three books and editor of two others, and the author of dozens of articles published in American, Canadian and Israeli books and law journals. Dean Bendor's books and articles were cited by the Supreme Court of Israel in dozens of decisions.

Contact at: Ariel.Bendor@biu.ac.il

Zachary Calo is Founding Full Professor at Hamad bin Khalifa University College of Law in Doha, an initiative of the Qatar Foundation and North Western University to offer the first Juris Doctor degree in the Middle East. He is also Research Scholar in Law and Religion at Valparaiso University and Visiting Professor at the Open University, UK. He has previously taught at Valparaiso University Law

School, Notre Dame Law School, DePaul University College of Law, and Hangdong International Law School in South Korea. He was visiting fellow at the Brookings Institution, the Pew Forum on Religion and Public Life, and the Institute for Humane Studies. Calo practiced law with Buckley Sandler LLP in Washington, DC. He holds a Bachelor of Arts and a Master of Arts in history from The Johns Hopkins University, a Juris Doctor from the University of Virginia School of Law, and a doctorate in history from the University of Pennsylvania. He is editor of the *Agape, Justice, and Law* (Cambridge University Press, 2017).

Contact at: zacharycalo@gmail.com

Paul Gowder is Professor of Law at the University of Iowa. His research has been focused on understanding the rule of law as an ideal at the nexus of normative political theory, constitutional law, and social science; other major areas of work include computational approaches to law—particularly the machine-reading of legal text and predicting legal outcomes—and their normative implications, democratic theory and judicial review, critical race theory, and Classical Athenian law and political thought.

Contact at: paul-gowder@uiowa.edu

Eugenia Relaño Pastor is Senior Researcher at the Law and Anthropology Department in the Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology in Halle, Germany, where she coordinates the development of a database on cultural and religious diversity (CUREDI), to address the management (and governance) of cultural and religious diversity by providing a new set of data on case law, legislations and regulations, public documents and policies across multiple EU Member States. Prior to joining the Max Planck Eugenia worked as a legal adviser for the Spanish Ombudsman in the Department of Migration and Equal Treatment and as a legal trainer for national human rights institutions in Kazakhstan, Armenia, Macedonia and Turkey. She holds bachelors degrees in political science and in sociology and a doctorate degree in law from the University of Granada. She is an Assistant Professor at Complutense University (Madrid). She was a Fulbright Fellow in the Salzburg Seminar in 2001. During 2005-2012 she was member of the ODIHR-OSCE Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion and Belief and now is the Spanish representative member of the Legal Working Group of the European Group of National Human Rights Institutions (Council of Europe).

Contact: pastor@eth.mpg.de

Andrea Pin is Associate Professor in constitutional and comparative law at the University of Padua. He holds a PhD from the University of Turin. He has clerked at the Italian Constitutional Court since 2011. He is a Senior Fellow at the Center for the Study of Law and Religion at Emory University. He has authored two books, edited two volumes, and translated two books into Italian. His fields of study cover law and religion, comparative perspectives on human rights, comparative federalism, and constitutional interpretation.

Contact at: andrea.pin@unipd.it

Giorgio Repetto is Associate Professor in Constitutional Law at the Faculty of Law of the University of Perugia, where he holds the chair of European Constitutional Law. He earned a Law degree at Luiss "Guido Carli" (summa cum laude and special mention), and holds a PhD in Public and Constitutional law from the University of Rome "La Sapienza". A Visiting Scholar at the Universities of Berlin (Humboldt), Hamburg and Freiburg, he obtained the degree of Full Professor in the fields of both Constitutional Law and Comparative Law. In 2012 he has been awarded with the "Premio Sergio Panunzio" granted by the Italian Association of Constitutional lawyers for the best monographic debut in the field of constitutional law. He is Co-Editor-in-chief of Rivista di diritti comparati and in the board of editors of Diritto pubblico, a leading law review in Italy in the field of public and constitutional law. His research interests cover theory and practice of fundamental rights,

sexual orientation law, constitutional adjudication in European and comparative law and constitutional theory.

Contact at: giorgio.repetto@unipg.it

Olga Rozenkranzova is Senior Lecturer at the Department of Theory of Law and Legal History at the Faculty of Law, Palacký University in Olomouc. She teaches legal methodology and general legal-theoretical issues. In 2018 she was appointed to the Disciplinary Senate in Judicial Matters to the Czech Supreme Administrative Court. She is the author of academic articles on anti-discrimination law, administrative law, and corporate law and recently published the article "Human Dignity by Giovanni Pico della Mirandola". She is currently working on the book "Human Dignity – Pico & Kant". In 2002-2014, she worked at the Czech Ombudsman's Office where she focused on administrative law, fair trial and anti-discrimination law. She completed her PhD in 2004 at Masaryk University in Brno Faculty of Law. Since 2017 she has been working with Menschenrechtszentrum Universität Potsdam. Since 2018 she has been contributing to the Metaphysics of Law project.

Contact at: olga.rosenkranzova@upol.cz

Brett G. Scharffs is Rex E. Lee Chair and Professor of Law and Director of the International Center for Law and Religion Studies at Brigham Young University Law School. He received a BSBA in international business and an MA in philosophy at Georgetown University and, as a Rhodes Scholar, earned a BPhil in philosophy at Oxford. He received his JD from Yale Law School, where he was senior editor of the Yale Law Journal. He is a recurring visiting professor at Central European University in Budapest and at the University of Adelaide Law School. He has for several years helped organize certificate training programs in religion and the rule of law in China and in Vietnam and has taught and helped organize programs at several Indonesian universities on sharia and human rights. Author of more than 100 articles and book chapters, he has made more than 300 scholarly presentations in 30 countries. His casebook, Law and Religion: National, International and Comparative Perspectives (with Cole Durham), has been translated into Chinese and Vietnamese, with Turkish, Burmese, Arabic, Russian, Greek, and Hebrew in process. He is author with Elizabeth Clark of Religion and Law in the USA, a 2016 contribution to Wolters Kluwer's International Encyclopaedia of Laws.

Contact at: scharffsb@law.byu.edu

Haim Shapira is Professor of law at Bar-Ilan University, Israel. His main areas of teaching and research are: Jewish law, rabbinic literature, legal theory and law and religion. He received his Ph.D. and other degrees in law and in Jewish studies from the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. His articles are published in Israeli, American and European leading journals. He was the Editor-in-Chief of Bar-Ilan Law Review and the Editor-in-chief of the Journal of Law, Religion and State and now a member of its editorial board. He was a research fellow and a visiting professor at various American and European universities including Milan University, School of Law (2016), NYU School of Law (2013-2014), The Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton (2005-2006).

Contact at: Haim.Shapira@biu.ac.il

Taixia Shen is Associate Professor of the Law School & Intellectual Property School of Jinan University in Canton of China. Her research fields are Human rights law, comparative law and Hong Kong law. She got her S.J.D at Renmin University of China, and got her L.L.M at the University of Paris 1 Pantheon-Sorbonne. She was a Visiting Scholar in the European Court of Human Rights in 2012, at the Faculty of Law of the University of Hong Kong in 2014 and in the CERIC of the Aix-Marseille University in 2016. She has published numerous articles on human rights education in China, relationship between the intellectual property and human rights and human rights protection mechanism of Hong Kong Special Administrative Region. Since 2012, she has promoted human rights

education in Jinan University and has started human rights courses for the students from law school and other schools.

Contact at: sunbird726@hotmail.com

Pinghua Sun has an MA in English Language and Literature (Beijing Normal University), an MA in Arts of English Language Teaching (the University of Warwick), and a PhD in Human Rights Law (China University of Political Science and Law). He is a visiting scholar at the University of Exeter School of Law. He currently serves as Professor at China University of Political Science and Law. His publications include: *The Study of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights* (Peking University Press 2012); *Human Rights Protection System in China* (Springer 2014), *Pengchun Chang: A Crucial Architect of the International Human Rights System* (Social Sciences Academic Press 2017); and *Historic Achievement of a Common Standard: Pengchun Chang and the Universal Declaration of Human Right* (Springer 2018). He attended international human rights conferences held in the UK, Switzerland, Italy, and the US. He presented on the UDHR in more than twenty Chinese universities including Peking University, Renmin University of China, Fudan University, Guangzhou University, Ji'nan University, Sun Yat-sen University, Beijing Normal University, Nankai University, Hebei University. He also ran a postgraduate course on human rights in China at the University of Exeter in 2011.

Contact at: fadaphsun@aliyun.com

Piotr Szymaniec currently holds the position of Vice-director of the Institute of Socio-Legal Studies at The Angelus Silesius University of Applied Sciences in Wałbrzych (Poland). He specializes in the history of legal, political and social thought, legal philosophy and public security. He is the author of more than forty publications, including the monograph *Republicanism for a Commercial Society. The Political and Legal Thought of Adam Ferguson* (2013, in Polish). He is the editor and co-author of the monographic volume *The Principle of Proportionality and the Protection of Fundamental Rights in the European States* (2015). He has participated in many international conferences, including in Stockholm, Hannover, Vienna, St. Petersburg and Banská Bystrica. Szymaniec holds a PhD in Law from the University of Wrocław.

Contact at: pszymaniec@poczta.onet.pl

Eugene Kheng Boon Tan is Associate Professor of Law at Singapore Management University School of Law. An advocate and solicitor of the Supreme Court of Singapore, he holds degrees from the National University of Singapore Faculty of Law, the London School of Economics, and Stanford University. Eugene teaches and researches in the area of constitutional and administrative law, the regulation of ethnic conflict, and the government and politics of Singapore. He has published in these areas in various edited volumes and in peer-reviewed journals including Australian Journal of Asian Law, The China Quarterly, Citizenship Studies, Ethnic and Racial Studies, Ethnopolitics, Israel Law Review, Journal of Church and State, Law and Policy, Singapore Year Book of International Law, Terrorism and Political Violence, and Yonsei Law Journal. Eugene regularly writes for and is quoted in the Singapore press, particularly on matters related to domestic politics. Tan served as a Nominated Member of Parliament between 14 February 2012 and 13 August 2014.

Contact at: eugene@smu.edu.sg

Christine Venter, a native of Zimbabwe, received her undergraduate and law degrees from the University of Cape Town in South Africa. She practiced law there with a civil rights firm for two years, before relocating to the United States to practice with a firm in California. She holds a Masters and Doctoral degree in International Human Rights from the University of Notre Dame. She wrote her doctoral dissertation on Women's Rights in post-apartheid South Africa. Venter teaches classes on Gender Issues in International Human Rights Law, Legal Writing, and Appellate Advocacy at Notre Dame Law School, where she is the Director of the Legal Writing Program. She is the author of a

book entitled *International Women's Rights: Equality and Justice,* as well as several articles. She is currently working on an article on Ruth Bader Ginsburg.

Contact at: Christine.M.Venter.3@nd.edu

Adriana Vieira is law professor at the Fluminense Federal University (UFF) at Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, Permanent Professor at the Post-Graduate Program of Law at federal University of Paraiba (PPGCJ/UFPB) and Permanent Professor at the Post-Graduate Program of Law, Institutions and Business at Fluminense Federal University (PPGDIM/UFF). She received PhD in Theory and History of Law – Theory and History of Human Rights from the Florence University and PhD in Sociology from the Federal University of Paraiba.

Contact at: a.diasvieira@gmail.com

Dmytro Vovk runs the Center for Rule of Law and Religion Studies at Yaroslav the Wise National Law University in Kharkiv, Ukraine. He teaches law at the same university and, as a guest lecturer, at the Ukrainian Catholic University. Dr. Vovk was Kennan-Fulbright Fellow at Woodrow Wilson Center in Washington, DC and Visiting Researcher at the Brigham Young University Law School International Center for Law and Religion Studies. He is a member of the OSCE/ODIHR Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief for 2019-2022. His last publications include, as author, *Theology of Soviet Law* (forthcoming in 2019), *Ukrainian Churches' Doctrines on Family, Gender and Sexuality and the European Integration Policy: Ethics versus Politics* (forthcoming in Springer in 2019), as editor, *Religion during the Russian-Ukrainian Conflict* (Routledge, 2019), *Law, Religion and Cinema* (2018, in Ukrainian), and, as translator, Paul Gowder, *Rule of Law in the Real World* (2018, in Ukrainian), W. Cole Durham, Jr. and Brett G. Scharffs, *Law and Religion: National, International and Comparative Perspectives* (forthcoming in 2019, in Russian).

Contact at: dmtr.vovk@gmail.com